



City of Mandeville
L O U I S I A N A

An Evaluation of the City of Mandeville Compensation and Benefit Plan

November 2021

Prepared by:

SSA Consultants

9331 Bluebonnet Boulevard
Baton Rouge, LA 70810
225-769-2676
www.consultssa.com

INTRODUCTION

The City of Mandeville (the City) contracted with SSA Consultants (SSA) in 2021 for professional consulting services for an evaluation of its Compensation Plan for its approximately 100 full-time and part-time employees. As stated in the contract, the goal of the Compensation Plan evaluation was to develop a compensation program to meet a set of specific objectives including:

- Collecting background data.
- Designing and administering a job analysis questionnaire.
- Performing job benchmarking and analysis.

SSA, a Louisiana-based business management and organizational design consulting firm with experience in conducting similar scopes of work, was engaged with the approval of the City and consulting activities began in May 2021.

The first part of the project evaluated the current salary and benefit structure. The methodology included the following activities:

- Analysis of each Job Analysis Questionnaire (JAQ) for each position.
- Review of the current compensation package for each job classification.
- Assessment of each job classification in relation to comparable classifications within the private and public sectors to determine the minimum compensation and benefit package for each job classification.

The second part of the project focused on formulating a salary and benefit structure to ensure the City remains an employer of choice.

Activities included:

- Identification of potential compensation issues and recommendations.
- Development of externally competitive and internally equitable salary recommendations for each position.
- Calculation of the estimated total cost for the City to move employees who are below the market range to the market minimum.
- Preparation of a report with the findings and recommendations for implementation.

This report constitutes the final deliverable of the project. The report includes SSA's findings and recommendations, along with a discussion of methodology, techniques, and data used to develop the findings and recommendations.

EVALUATION AND ASSESSMENT

To achieve the objectives established in the contract, the first part of the project evaluated the current salary and benefit structure through the following activities:

- Analysis of each Job Analysis Questionnaire (JAQ) for each position.
- Review of the current compensation package for each job classification.
- Assessment of each job classification in relation to comparable classifications within the private and public sectors to determine the minimum compensation and benefit package for each job classification.

Methodology

The project began with three key steps: 1) data request; 2) JAQ administration; and 3) JAQ analysis and comparative match. This section of the report provides a description of each step.

Data Request

To begin the project, SSA collected background data from the City to understand the current compensation plan and its structure. The data request included job descriptions, current pay plan and benefit information, organization charts and the table of organization, manuals and documents describing pay policies, and contact information for key leaders and other staff vital to the accuracy of information and the success of this project.

Job Analysis Questionnaire Administration

Each position was reviewed using job descriptions provided by the City. The job description review was aided by the administration of a Job Analysis Questionnaire (JAQ) which was completed by each employee and reviewed by the employee's supervisor and department director. The JAQ process ensured that SSA had the most accurate representation of duties and responsibilities for each position.

JAQ Review and Comparative Match

Each JAQ was assessed and matched to comparable position descriptions within SSA's database. The City's salary range and midpoint for each position was then matched to the comparable regional market-based range and midpoint. This was reviewed by the City's Compensation Evaluation Steering Committee comprised of staff leadership, department directors, and key Human Resources personnel.

Comparative Salary Range Analysis

This section of the report presents the salary range analysis which compares the City's salary range to the market-based salary ranges.

Figure 1 provides a description of the column headers for the Salary Range Analysis chart (**Figure 2**).

Figure 1. Description of Comparative Salary Range Analysis Charts

Column Name	Column Description
Department	The City of Mandeville department in which the job position is located.
Position	The City of Mandeville position title.
City of Mandeville Hourly Min and Max	The City of Mandeville minimum and maximum salary and wage.
Market Hourly Min and Max	The market-based minimum and maximum salary and wage.
Difference Between Minimums	The difference between the City of Mandeville minimum and the market minimum.

- **Yellow highlight** on **Figure 2** indicates a salary minimum and maximum where the City is lower than the market value.

Figure 2. City of Mandeville Comparative Salary Range Analysis

Department	Position	Mandeville Hourly Min	Mandeville Hourly Max	Market Hourly Min	Market Hourly Max	Difference Between Minimums
Administration	Grants and Contracts Administrator	\$19.76	\$40.44	\$24.68	\$36.52	\$4.92
Administration	Executive Assistant	Negotiated	Negotiated	\$32.83	\$49.25	--
Buildings and Grounds	Assistant Superintendent	\$16.04	\$32.82	\$27.39	\$39.44	\$11.35
Buildings and Grounds	Superintendent of Buildings & Grounds/Streets	\$19.76	\$40.44	\$31.03	\$46.55	\$11.27
Buildings and Grounds	Electrical Technician	\$19.06	\$39.00	\$25.87	\$38.80	\$6.81
Buildings and Grounds	Maintenance I	\$11.19	\$22.90	\$14.50	\$21.74	\$3.31
Buildings and Grounds	Maintenance II	\$12.53	\$25.64	\$16.14	\$24.20	\$3.61
City Council	Council Clerk	--	--	\$19.02	\$28.53	--
Communications	Dispatcher	\$13.77	\$28.18	\$14.29	\$21.43	\$0.52
Criminal Investigations	Sergeant	\$16.98	\$34.75	\$20.76	\$31.14	\$3.78
Cultural Dev and Events	Community Center Clerk I	\$10.02	\$20.51	\$12.00	\$18.00	\$1.98
Cultural Dev and Events	Community Center Coordinator	\$16.04	\$32.82	\$23.21	\$34.81	\$7.17
Cultural Dev and Events	Director of Cultural Development and Events	Negotiated	Negotiated	\$37.07	\$55.60	\$0.00
Engineering	City Engineer/ Program Manager	Negotiated	Negotiated	\$34.91	\$52.36	\$0.00

Department	Position	Mandeville Hourly Min	Mandeville Hourly Max	Market Hourly Min	Market Hourly Max	Difference Between Minimums
Finance	Accountant	\$19.76	\$40.44	\$26.60	\$39.90	\$6.84
Finance	Accounting Specialist	\$14.74	\$30.16	\$15.98	\$23.97	\$1.24
Finance	Accounts Payable Clerk II	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$17.34	\$26.01	\$3.00
Finance	Clerk II, City Clerk	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$17.34	\$26.01	\$3.00
Finance	Clerk II, City Court	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$17.34	\$26.01	\$3.00
Finance	Data Entry Clerk I	\$11.19	\$22.90	\$11.66	\$17.48	\$0.47
Finance	Finance Director	Negotiated	Negotiated	\$44.61	\$66.92	\$0.00
Finance	Purchasing Agent	\$19.76	\$40.44	\$23.81	\$35.72	\$4.05
Finance	Receptionist	\$11.19	\$22.90	\$10.89	\$16.33	\$0.00
Finance	Utility Billing Clerk II	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$13.48	\$20.23	\$0.00
Human Resources	HR Assistant	\$19.01	\$38.90	\$21.33	\$32.00	\$2.32
Human Resources	HR Director	\$21.02	\$43.02	\$36.49	\$54.74	\$15.47
Legal	City Attorney	Negotiated	Negotiated	\$52.06	\$78.08	\$0.00
Planning	Building Official	\$29.25	\$59.86	\$34.36	\$51.53	\$5.11
Planning	Director of Planning and Development	Negotiated	Negotiated	\$41.57	\$62.36	\$0.00

Department	Position	Mandeville Hourly Min	Mandeville Hourly Max	Market Hourly Min	Market Hourly Max	Difference Between Minimums
Planning	GIS Administrator	\$18.37	\$37.59	\$21.14	\$31.70	\$2.77
Planning	Landscape and Urban Forestry Inspector	\$16.04	\$32.82	\$22.74	\$34.11	\$6.70
Planning	Permit Coordinator	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$14.85	\$22.27	\$1.11
Planning	Planner I	\$18.37	\$37.59	\$18.86	\$28.28	\$0.49
Planning	Planner II	\$22.13	\$45.29	\$26.77	\$40.16	\$4.64
Police	Assistant Chief	\$23.77	\$48.64	\$34.87	\$50.21	\$11.10
Police	Captain	\$20.05	\$41.03	\$31.47	\$45.32	\$11.42
Police	Detective	\$16.17	\$33.09	\$19.05	\$27.43	\$2.88
Police	Evidence Clerk II	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$15.58	\$23.37	\$1.84
Police	Information Technology Manager	\$22.07	\$45.16	\$37.06	\$55.59	\$14.99
Police	Lieutenant	\$18.23	\$37.31	\$26.09	\$37.57	\$7.68
Police	Officer	\$16.17	\$33.09	\$19.05	\$27.43	\$2.88
Police	Police Chief	--	--	\$38.01	\$57.11	--
Police	Police Chief Secretary	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$17.34	\$26.01	\$3.00
Police	Records Clerk I	\$11.19	\$22.90	\$12.36	\$18.53	\$1.17

Department	Position	Mandeville Hourly Min	Mandeville Hourly Max	Market Hourly Min	Market Hourly Max	Difference Between Minimums
Police	School Resource Officer	\$16.17	\$33.09	\$19.05	\$27.43	\$2.88
Police	Sergeant	\$16.98	\$34.75	\$23.31	\$35.57	\$6.33
Police	Training Officer	\$16.17	\$33.09	\$19.05	\$27.43	\$2.88
Public Works	Clerk II, Administrative Coordinator	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$17.34	\$26.01	\$3.00
Public Works	Director of Public Works	Negotiated	Negotiated	\$49.56	\$74.35	\$0.00
Public Works	Engineering Assistant/Assistant Director	\$19.76	\$40.44	\$27.31	\$40.96	\$7.55
Public Works	Field Representative	\$16.04	\$32.82	\$21.47	\$32.20	\$5.43
Public Works	Meter Technician	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$20.49	\$30.74	\$0.00
Public Works	Treatment Plant Operator (Wastewater Plant Manager)	\$15.56	\$31.84	\$21.38	\$32.07	\$5.82
Public Works	Utilities Superintendent	\$19.76	\$40.44	\$31.03	\$46.55	\$11.27
Public Works	Water Plant Operator (Water Treatment Plant Manager)	\$15.56	\$31.84	\$21.86	\$32.79	\$6.30
Sewers	Equipment Operator	\$14.74	\$30.16	\$20.54	\$30.81	\$2.27
Streets	Assistant Superintendent	\$16.04	\$32.82	\$27.39	\$39.44	\$11.35
Streets	Equipment Operator	\$14.74	\$30.16	\$20.54	\$30.81	\$5.80
Traffic	Lieutenant	\$18.23	\$37.31	\$26.09	\$37.57	\$7.68

Department	Position	Mandeville Hourly Min	Mandeville Hourly Max	Market Hourly Min	Market Hourly Max	Difference Between Minimums
Traffic	Officer	\$16.17	\$33.09	\$19.05	\$27.43	\$2.88
Traffic	Sergeant	\$16.98	\$34.75	\$23.31	\$35.57	\$6.33
Water	Assistant Superintendent	\$16.04	\$32.82	\$27.39	\$39.44	\$11.35
Water	Equipment Operator	\$14.74	\$30.16	\$20.54	\$30.81	\$5.80
Water	Maintenance I	\$11.19	\$22.90	\$14.50	\$21.74	\$3.31
Water	Maintenance II	\$12.53	\$25.64	\$16.14	\$24.20	\$3.61
Various	Secretary	\$13.74	\$28.12	\$17.34	\$26.01	\$3.60

OBSERVATIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS

The second phase of the project focused on providing the City's leadership with recommendations to formulate a salary and benefit structure that would ensure it remains an employer of choice. Activities in this phase included:

- Identification of potential compensation issues and recommendations.
- Development of externally competitive and internally equitable salary recommendations for each position.
- Calculation of the estimated total cost for the City to move employees who are below the market range to the market minimum.
- Preparation of a report with the findings and recommendations for implementation.

Comparative Salary Range Analysis Observations

The comparative salary range analysis is provided in the previous section of this report in **Figure 2**. The following are observations based on this analysis of the 66 positions with 100 incumbents.

- The comparative salary range analysis indicates 83% (55 positions of 66 positions) of the City salary ranges (minimum and maximum) fall below the market-based range. This does not mean that any individual employee is necessarily paid below the minimum; rather, this analysis is based strictly on range comparisons. Because many organizations hire at or near the minimum, the City may find it difficult to attract qualified employees unless the market range minimums are adjusted.
- There are 41 incumbents (out of 100) that are paid below the market-based minimum for their position.

Comparative Benefit Package Analysis

SSA reviewed the City’s benefit package which includes annual leave, sick leave, health insurance, retirement, and other benefits.

Annual Leave Policy

Figure 3 depicts the City’s current annual leave system which allows for the accumulation of annual leave days earned.

Figure 3. City of Mandeville’s Annual Leave

Years of Service	Total Annual Leave Days Earned Per Year
0-5 years	12 days
6-10 years	15 days
11+ years	19½ days

Figure 4. compares the annual leave accumulation of South Louisiana parishes by years of service.

Figure 4. Annual Leave Comparison – City of Mandeville to Regional and Similar Sized Peers

Years of Service	Mandeville	Years of Service	Covington	Years of Service	Abita Springs	Years of Service	Slidell	Years of Service	Kenner	Years of Service	Hammond
0-5 years	12 days	0-3 years	½ day per full month of service	1 year	5 days	0-1 year	12 days	0-5 years	12 days	0-1 years	5 days
6-10 years	15 days	3-5 years	12 days	2 years and up	additional day by year	1-4 years	15 days	5-10 years	18 days	1-4 years	10 days
11 years and up	19½ days	5-9 years	15 days			5-9 years	18 days	10 years and up	24 days	4-9 years	15 days
		10-14 years	20 days			10-14 years	21 days			9 years and up	20 days
		15-19 years	23 days			15 years and up	24 days				
		20 years and up	25 days								

The City of Mandeville’s annual leave policy is comparable to its regional peers.

Sick Leave Policy

City employees accrue sick leave at a rate of 48 hours per year. Unused leave rolls over at the end of each year to the following year with no limit of accrual limit. Employees begin to accrue sick leave as soon as they are hired. Employees forfeit all unused hours of sick leave when they retire.

Figure 5 compares the City’s annual sick leave earned amounts with those of regional and similar sized peers.

Figure 5. Sick Leave Comparison – City of Mandeville to Regional and Similar Sized Peers

Sick Leave Total Annual Days Earned Per Year						
Years of Service	Mandeville	Covington	Abita Springs	Slidell	Kenner	Hammond
Day 1 and up	6 days 6 days (extended sick bank)	9 days	10 days	12 days	12 days	12 days

The City of Mandeville’s sick leave policy is comparable to other regional peers; however, the City does not have a total limit on sick leave accumulation which may pose risks in the future.

Holidays

The City's holiday policy allows employees to observe 14 paid holidays per year (after the first 30 days of employment). The policy allows for additional holidays to be added at the discretion of the City. Any holiday that occurs on a Saturday or Sunday is observed on the closest workday.

1. New Year's Day
2. Dr. Martin Luther King Day
3. President's Day
4. Lundi Gras
5. Mardi Gras
6. Good Friday
7. Memorial Day
8. Independence Day
9. Labor Day
10. Columbus Day
11. Veteran's Day
12. Thanksgiving Day
13. Day After Thanksgiving
14. Christmas Day

The regional peer groups offered between 12 and 15 paid holidays per year.

The City of Mandeville's holiday policy is comparable to their regional peer group.

Health Insurance

Figure 6 compares the City’s monthly employee contributions, annual deductible, co-insurance, and the annual out-of-pocket maximum to those of regional and similar sized peers.

Figure 6. Health Insurance Comparison – City of Mandeville Compared to Regional and Similar Sized Peers

Health Insurance Plan					
Medical Premium	Mandeville	Covington	Tangipahoa	Slidell	Hammond
Monthly Employee Contributions					
Employee Only	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$82.94	\$0
Employee + Family	\$60	\$292.47	\$450.96	\$507.44	\$574.79
Annual Deductible (Individual/Family)					
In-Network	\$0 / \$0	\$1,500 / \$3,000	\$1,000 / \$1,920	\$750 / \$2,250	\$3,000 / \$6,000
Out-of-Network	\$5,000 / \$10,000	\$4,500 / \$9,000	NA / NA	\$1,500 / \$4,500	\$6,000 / \$12,000
Co-Insurance (Percentage Owed by Employee)					
In-Network	100%	30%	20%	80%	100%
Out-of-Network	50%	50%	NA	50%	80%
Annual Out-of-Pocket Maximum (Individual/Family)					
In-Network	\$6,000 / \$12,000	\$6,500 / \$13,000	\$5,000 / \$9,600	\$3,000 / \$6,000	\$5,000 / \$10,000
Out-of-Network	\$18,000 / \$36,000	\$19,500 / \$39,000	NA / NA	\$9,000 / \$18,000	\$10,000 / \$20,000

Figure 7. Prescription Drug Benefit Comparison – City of Mandeville to Regional Peers

Prescription Drug Benefit Co-Pays Retail						
City	Mandeville	Covington		Tangipahoa	Slidell	Hammond
Status	In & Out of Network	In-Network	Out of Network	In & Out of Network	In and Out of Network	In & Out of Network
Tier 1 – Generic	\$10	\$10	\$10 + 30% Co-Insurance	100% after Deductible	\$10	100% after deductible
Tier 2 – Preferred	\$40	\$40	\$40 + 30% Co-Insurance	100% after Deductible	\$20	80% after deductible
Tier 3 – Non-Preferred	\$70	\$70	\$70 + 30% Co-Insurance	100% after Deductible	\$50	80% after deductible
Tier 4 – Injectables	NA	25% co-insurance	25% + 30% Co-Insurance	100% after Deductible	\$50	--

The City of Mandeville offers health plan benefits that are favorable to those of other regional peers.

Retirement

The City participates in the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Louisiana, Plan A. All eligible employees of the City (except those specifically excluded) must become members of the system. All City employees who are members of Plan A are eligible to retire and receive normal benefits if they have credit for at least 25 years of Plan A service or at least 10 years of Plan A service and are at least 60 years of age. Normal retirement benefits are paid for the life of the retiree. Currently, each employee hired after January 1, 2013, is required to contribute 9.5% tax deferred income to the retirement plan. The plan features a 3% accrual rate for each year of service. Employees are vested with seven years of service credit. The employer contribution rate for the 2019-2020 fiscal year is 27.75% of total member/employee earnings.

Currently, the Municipal Employees' Retirement System of Louisiana has 155 participating members. The Municipal Employees' Retirement System does offer a Plan B, which requires lower employee (5%) and employer (14%) contribution rates, but the accrual rate of 2% provides a significantly lower payout upon retirement.

The City of Mandeville offers standard retirement options for municipalities located in Louisiana.

Other Notable Employee Benefits

The City offers additional employee benefits including dental insurance, basic life insurance, and vision insurance.

The City of Mandeville offers employee benefits that are comparable to those of other regional peers.

Compensation Philosophy Considerations

With the onset of the COVID-19 crisis, compensation philosophy considerations are important now more than ever before. As America returns to work, maintaining a level of compensation and benefits which are enticing to potential employees will separate employers of choice. Previously vacated positions will return and competition for qualified candidates will increase. Compensating employees at market-based levels will attract high quality candidates and continue to supply the City with an excellent workforce for the future.

Attracting and retaining talented employees will increasingly require compensation and benefit systems that are more market-based than the traditional public sector model. Market-based compensation and benefit models include greater flexibility to price to the market for skills and experience, reward performance, and offer benefits attractive to the workforce of today and tomorrow.

Police Incentive and Competitive Salary Research

Due to recent political and social attention, there has been a renewed interest in ensuring that police officers are as well-educated and prepared as possible. Incentive programs, accordingly, have become increasingly popular for police departments and is quickly becoming part of best practices around the country. The most popular incentive programs are made up of education and field-training certifications.

Many major police departments and sheriff's offices in Louisiana have created an incentive program for their officers. Two of Mandeville Police Department's regional peers have also implemented their own incentive programs, which are listed below.

St. Tammany Parish Sheriff's Office:

- Associate Degree - \$500/year
- Bachelor's degree - \$1,000/year
- Master's Degree - \$2,000/year

New Orleans Police Department:

- Associate Degree - \$1,000/year
- Bachelor's Degree - \$2,000/year
- Master's or Doctorate Degree - \$3,000/year
- Field Training Officer - \$1,500/year
- Special Operations Division - \$1,500/year
- Marine Unit (Divers) - \$1,500/year
- K-9 (Handlers) - \$1,500/year
- Mounted (Horse) - \$1,500/year
- Traffic (Motorcycle) - \$1,500/year
- Bomb Squad - \$1,500/year

Figure 8 compares the City’s Police Department salaries to those of regional and similar sized peers.

Figure 8. Police Salary Comparison – City of Mandeville Compared to Regional and Similar Sized Peers

Police Salary Comparison Chart					
Position	Mandeville	Slidell Police Department	Covington Police Department (Minimum Only)	Louisiana State Police	St. Tammany Parish Sheriff’s Office (Minimum Only)
Officer	\$33,634 - \$68,827	\$36,000 - \$61,500	\$38,001	\$46,610 - \$94,748	\$37,900
Sergeant	\$35,318 - \$72,280	\$54,500 - \$66,500	\$42,619	\$51,504 - \$104,697	\$45,300
Lieutenant	\$37,918 - \$77,605	\$62,500 - \$73,000	\$48,526	\$56,911 - \$115,690	\$49,100
Captain	\$41,704 - \$85,342	\$75,000 - \$84,000	--	\$64,774 - \$131,672	\$56,000

Recommendations

The following recommendations are provided to City of Mandeville.

Recommendation 1: Establish Salary Ranges with Current Market-Based Minimums and Maximums for All Job Positions

The City of Mandeville should establish salary ranges, including minimums and maximums, for all positions utilizing market-based salary data. This adjustment will address the identified positions that fall below the market-based range.

Recommendation 2: Conduct Market-Based Compensation Review Every Three to Five Years

The City of Mandeville should, in compliance with best practices, conduct a market-based compensation review every three to five years to ensure compensation and benefits retain internal equity and external competitiveness.

Recommendation 3: Institute a Limit to Total Sick Leave Accumulation

The City of Mandeville should institute a limit to the total amount of sick leave which may be accumulated by employees of the City. This will reduce total liability the City may carry due to large amounts of employee sick leave. Many municipalities and parishes have used a 420-hour limit. Current employees who already exceed the limit chosen by the City may need to be grandfathered during a transition phase.

Recommendation 4: Bring Incumbents into the Market Range

The City of Mandeville should bring the salaries of all incumbents who currently fall below the market minimum into the provided market ranges. This adjustment will address the identified incumbents who are below the market-based minimum. This will also help retain current employees and ensure that new employees in those job classifications receive market competitive pay.

At the request of the City, SSA has estimated the total cost for bringing the identified incumbents whose current pay rate is below the market minimum up to the market minimum rate. The following shows the total cost for bringing those 41 employees up to 100% of the market minimum. The rates have been annualized and combined to provide a total yearly cost for the City.

Total Cost: \$189,276.11

In addition to calculating the total cost to bring Mandeville employees up to the Market Minimum, SSA also estimated the potential total cost to bring employees in line with market value based on their total years of service and the market valuation of their position. This included a 2.5% per year of service as consistent with the current pay plan and included salary cap maximums based on identified labor grade. The approximate total salary cost associated with this implementation is listed below:

Total Salary Cost Including Longevity: \$736,838.31

Please note that this calculation is based on salaries alone and does not include potential changes to benefit load. This is an estimate provided by SSA. The Finance Department will provide final cost calculations.

Appendix A – Mayor Salary Research

City of Hammond	City of Alexandria	City of Slidell	City of Ruston	City of Thibodaux	City of Gonzales	City of Zachary	City of Covington
\$75,500	\$131,106	\$123,091	\$98,077	\$82,400	\$140,916	\$85,000	\$73,443

Average of All - \$101,192