

Historic Preservation District Commission

Public Hearing –November 28, 2017

Page 1

Call to order

Mr. Jeff Bernard- Chairman, called the meeting to order.

Commissioners- Present: Jeff Bernard, Jason Zuckerman, Richard Adamiak,

John Crane, Jill McGuire, Terri Hamilton and Susan Danielson

Administrator: Louise Scott; Secretary: Kathy Reeves

NEW BUSINESS

1). HC17-11-15: Application for COA-Demolition of main structure-806 Park Ave

Ms. Scott started the case with a power point showing the 2015 HPDC survey sheet. It was rated non-contributing with no style. She stated the B-2 zoned property (commercial business highway) was legally non-conforming residence , which the owners were petitioning the City Council to re-zone as R-1 to build back to a residential property. She also pointed out the original COA request was for demolition, but had an offer to relocate the structure. The power point continued with the plans to build a traditional Acadian style house. There was also information from the potential relocation company, West 30's, which was represented by Mr. Gibson. Pictures of the interior of the house were presented with a final conceptual picture of proposed new home.

Mr. Bernard stated he had gone to the site, which looked stable but radically altered. Ms. Danielson asked if those were the original windows, which Mr. Burns said they were aluminum. Mr. Crane said he noticed the property was next to modern houses, but seemed like there was no consistency. Mr. Zuckerman asked what the plans for the other structures were, which Mr. Burns replied the architect planned on utilizing them. Mr. Adamiak asked what the chances of relocation were, which Mr. Burns stated that relocation was the goal , as he had a couple of offers. Ms. McGuire said she was aware of the West 30's project and thought it was great.

Mr. Bernard made a motion to approve the COA application since it met all the criteria for demolition or relocation. Mr. Zuckerman seconded .

Roll Call:

Susan Danielson- Aye

Jeff Bernard-Aye

John Crane-Aye

Jill McGuire-Aye

Richard Adamiak-Aye

Jason Zuckerman-Aye

Terri Hamilton-Aye

All were in favor, the motion carried.

2). HC17-11-16: Application for COA-New Residential Construction-2411 Monroe

Ms. Scott started the presentation power point with the information from HC17-04-02, COA approval for demolition on April 26, 2017. She stated a COA for new residential construction requires approval from the HPD Commission if it was greater than four thousand (4000) square feet and the application was 7,653 square feet. Ms. Scott included the pictures of the potential conceptual houses

## Historic Preservation District Commission

### Public Hearing –November 28, 2017

#### Page 2

and letter of intentions submitted by Ms. Magee. Ms. Scott continued the presentation with the new residential elevations, house layout which showed access from Adair Street and Monroe, and planned materials to be used. There were also pictures of the surrounding properties. Ms. Scott reminded the Commissioners to use the “standards for new construction”.

Ms. McGuire asked how big the property was that included both lots, which Ms. Scott responded was about .772 of an acre.

Mr. Zuckerman asked about the original submission at the time of demolition request. Ms. Magee responded that the purchase agreement was depended upon demolition approval. She stated she did not have an architect at that time and just picked some types of houses she liked. Ms. Magee said once the demolition was completed, the survey showed the flood zones and it determined the shape of the house. Mr. Adamiak commented that the scale of the house seemed about twice the size of the original vision.

Mr. Zuckerman stated that according to Article 7.6.4.13-2: standards for new construction, a). all new construction shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which they are related, this plan did not meet this criteria. He felt it did not meet the “street scape”. Ms. McGuire asked if the “street scape” was just to be within the immediate block. She also asked if there was a “condition” that was included with the demolition approval. Ms. Scott stated there was not a specific condition, but the Commission asked for them to submit a concept. Mr. Zuckerman wanted it to be clear there should not be one (1) particular style or architecture they were looking for, but more of the scale and streetscape, relative and sensitive to the surrounding properties.

Ms. Danielson pointed out the house plans show a different plan than the submitted colored drawing. Mr. Al Jones, architect of record, said the grade around the house was around nine (9), but after talking to Ms. Magee they changed the finished floor to around thirteen (13) to give her a piece of mind.

Ms. Scott read from the CLURO Article 7.6.4.1: Purpose of the Historic Preservation District points one, two, three and specifically four, which pointed out the maintenance of the eclectic architectural quality of the District by guiding new construction on parcels to be compatible with existing scale and architectural styles.

Mr. Bernard asked for any comments from the audience. Mr. Lynn Mitchell stated that design review would look if the plan had an “open and inviting” entrance. He thought it looked like the house needed to be flipped.

Mr. Zuckerman read from article 7.6.4.13: Standards for COA, 2.e- vehicular oriented design shall be discouraged.

Ms. Rohrbough, 2525 Lakeshore Drive, agreed with what she was hearing, that maybe more green space and not opening on Monroe Street would help the impact on the cottage next door. Ms. Sinclair, 300 Carroll, stated she liked the eclectic charm of old Mandeville, not a cookie cutter, but that maybe the scale could come down a bit.

Mr. Zuckerman thought there was an opportunity to take that large element, garage, and vehicular access, and put it to the back part of the property. Mr. John Jones, architect, said that moving that may put house in the flood zone.

Ms. Magee said the property in old Mandeville has gotten so high that no one was going to pay thousands of dollars and build a cottage.



Historic Preservation District Commission

Public Hearing –November 28, 2017

Page 3

Ms. McGuire asked if the applicants were willing to change the plans before they vote, which Mr. Jones said no, not unless they were forced to.

Mr. Zuckerman made a motion to deny the COA application HC17-11-16 for new residential construction based on presently submitted plans. Ms. Danielson seconded the motion.

Roll Call:

Susan Danielson-Aye

Jeff Bernard-Aye

John Crane-Aye

Jill McGuire-Aye

Richard Adamiak-Aye

Jason Zuckerman-Aye

Terri Hamilton-Aye

All were in favor, the motion carried.

OLD BUSINESS

1). HC17-11-14: Application for COA-residential addition-300 Carroll:

Ms. Scott started with the original power point shown at the November 2, 2017 meeting. She showed the original submitted plans and then showed the revised plans. Mr. Zuckerman thought the scale looked great, as he used the National Park Service as a guideline which encouraged the new not mimic the old, only to speak towards it. Mr. Bernard agreed that after reading the guidelines, he felt the new should complement the original structure.

Mr. Crane made a motion to approve the COA application HC17-11-14 for residential addition based on the revised plans submitted tonight. Mr. Adamiak seconded the motion.

Ms. Rohrbough, 2525 Lakeshore, stated she had concern of the obtrusiveness of the staircase for the addition.

Roll Call:

Susan Danielson-Aye

Jeff Bernard-Aye

John Crane-Aye

Jill McGuire-Aye

Richard Adamiak-Aye

Jason Zuckerman-Aye

Terri Hamilton-Aye

All were in favor, the motion carried.

Historic Preservation District Commission

Public Hearing –November 28, 2017

Page 4

2). HC17-08-11: Application for COA-residential elevation-1724 Claiborne:

Ms. Scott revisited the original power point and followed it up with two (2) new plans. Option A plan submitted showed the front car port raised as high as the house would be raised, and Option B showed the car port left at its existing height. Ms. Danielson stated she had concerns about the oak tree. Ms. Scott stated the City's arborist had already looked at the project and felt it should be fine, but would monitor it.

Ms. Zuckerman made a motion to approve option B, leaving the car port at the lower (existing) level with the same architectural features it had. Mr. Crane seconded the motion.

Roll Call:

Susan Danielson-Aye

Jeff Bernard-Aye

John Crane-Aye

Jill McGuire-Aye

Richard Adamiak-Aye

Jason Zuckerman-Aye

Terri Hamilton-Aye

All were in favor, the motion carried.

3). HC17-08-12: Application for COA-exterior renovations-137 Girod:

Ms. Scott started with the original power point and added the newly submitted materials and railing style. Also shown was a photo dated 1983 submitted by Mr. Adamiak.

Mr. Zuckerman made a motion to approve the COA application HC17-08-12 for exterior renovations based on the newly submitted details for the addition of porches. Mr. Bernard seconded the motion.

Roll Call:

Susan Danielson-Aye

Jeff Bernard-Aye

John Crane-Aye

Jill McGuire-Aye

Richard Adamiak-Aye

Jason Zuckerman-Aye

Terri Hamilton-Aye

All were in favor, the motion carried.

Historic Preservation District Commission

Public Hearing –November 28, 2017

Page 5

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Mr. Bernard commented that he and Ms. Scott attended the Past /Forward National Trust for Historic Preservation National Conference that was held in Chicago. He stated it was a great time and was very informative.

Mr. Paul Harrison, City Attorney, stated he had met with Mr. Edward Deano, also City Attorney, about regulations for demolition by neglect. The difficulty would be defining the extent that the Commission would be allowed to repair, because greater the cost the greater the impact on the owner.


Ms. Scott announced the December 21 would be the next meeting and there was already one applicant. The December 7<sup>th</sup> meeting was cancelled due to no COA applications. She encouraged everyone to let the City know if they could not make the meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Mr. Zuckerman made a motion to adjourn and Mr. Bernard seconded.



Kathy Reeves, Secretary



Jeff Bernard, Chairman

